Bryan S. Alterman Trust v. Commissioner of Internal Revenue, 146 T. C. 226 (U. S. Tax Court 2016)

In a significant ruling on trust net worth for litigation costs, the U. S. Tax Court denied the Bryan S. Alterman Trust's motion for administrative and litigation fees under IRC Section 7430. The court clarified that for trusts, net worth must be assessed at the end of the taxable year involved in the dispute, not when the petition is filed. This decision impacts trusts seeking costs in tax disputes by setting a clear temporal benchmark for net worth evaluation, potentially affecting future litigation strategies.

Parties

The petitioner was the Bryan S. Alterman Trust U/A/D May 9, 2000, with Bryan S. Alterman as Trustee and Transferee. The respondent was the Commissioner of Internal Revenue.

Facts

The Bryan S. Alterman Trust was involved in a consolidated case with other trusts regarding the transferee liability for Alterman Corp. 's 2003 income tax liability. In a prior ruling, the Tax Court held that the Commissioner failed to meet the burden of proof to establish the Trust's liability under IRC Section 6901. Following this victory, the Trust sought to recover administrative and litigation costs under IRC Section 7430, claiming to be the prevailing party. The Trust's net worth exceeded $2 million as of December 31, 2003, the end of the taxable year involved in the proceeding, as per the notice of liability issued by the Commissioner.

Procedural History

The case originated with the Commissioner issuing a notice of liability to the Trust for the taxable year ended December 31, 2003. The Trust filed a petition with the U. S. Tax Court on March 22, 2010, challenging this liability. The court consolidated the Trust's case with other similar cases for the purpose of issuing an opinion on the transferee liability issue. After prevailing on the liability issue in a memorandum decision (T. C. Memo 2015-231), the Trust moved for costs under IRC Section 7430. The court required the Trust to supplement its motion to address the net worth requirement for trusts, leading to the final decision on the costs motion.

Issue(s)

Whether the Bryan S. Alterman Trust met the net worth requirement under IRC Section 7430(c)(4)(D)(i)(II) for trusts to recover administrative and litigation costs?

Rule(s) of Law

IRC Section 7430(c)(4)(D)(i)(II) states that for trusts, the net worth requirement

© 2025 SCOTUSreports.com. All rights reserved.

“shall be determined as of the last day of the taxable year involved in the proceeding. ” This provision modifies the general rule found in 28 U. S. C. Section 2412(d)(2)(B), which applies to individuals and requires a net worth not exceeding $2 million at the time the civil action was filed.

Holding

The U. S. Tax Court held that the Bryan S. Alterman Trust did not meet the net worth requirement under IRC Section 7430(c)(4)(D)(i)(II) because its net worth exceeded $2 million as of December 31, 2003, the last day of the taxable year involved in the proceeding. Therefore, the Trust was not entitled to recover administrative and litigation costs.

Reasoning

The court’s reasoning centered on the interpretation of IRC Section 7430(c)(4)(D)(i)(II). The court rejected the Trust’s arguments that there was no taxable year involved or that the valuation date should be based on the date of the notice of liability or the petition filing. The court emphasized that the statute clearly mandated the use of the last day of the taxable year involved in the proceeding, which was December 31, 2003, as specified in the Commissioner’s notice of liability. The court also noted that this rule prevents manipulation of net worth by trusts to meet the statutory limit. The decision was consistent with prior case law, such as Estate of Kunze v. Commissioner, which interpreted similar provisions for estates. The court did not address other arguments raised by the parties since the Trust’s failure to meet the net worth requirement was dispositive.

Disposition

The U. S. Tax Court denied the Bryan S. Alterman Trust’s motion for an award of administrative and litigation costs and entered a decision for the Trust on the underlying tax liability issue.

Significance/Impact

This decision clarifies the application of the net worth requirement for trusts under IRC Section 7430, setting a precedent that the evaluation must occur at the end of the taxable year involved in the dispute. This ruling may affect how trusts approach litigation cost recovery, requiring them to consider their net worth at a specific historical point rather than at the time of filing a petition. The decision underscores the importance of statutory language in determining eligibility for costs and may influence future legislative or judicial interpretations of similar provisions for other entities.

© 2025 SCOTUSreports.com. All rights reserved.