Julia R. Swords Trust v. Commissioner, 143 T. C. 1 (2014)

The U. S. Tax Court ruled that the Julia R. Swords Trust, along with other trusts, were not liable as transferees under IRC Section 6901 for Davreyn Corporation's unpaid federal income tax. The court rejected the IRS's attempt to recharacterize the trusts' sale of Davreyn stock as a fraudulent transfer, emphasizing that the trusts lacked knowledge of the subsequent tax avoidance scheme. This decision reinforces the principle that transferee liability under Section 6901 requires a basis in state law and highlights the court's reluctance to apply federal substance-over-form doctrines in determining such liability.

Parties

The plaintiffs in this case were the Julia R. Swords Trust, the David P. Reynolds Trust, the Margaret R. Mackell Trust, and the Dorothy R. Brotherton Trust (collectively referred to as the petitioner trusts). The defendant was the Commissioner of Internal Revenue. The petitioner trusts were represented by their cotrustees, Margaret R. Mackell, Dorothy R. Brotherton, and Julia R. Swords, at all stages of litigation.

Facts

Davreyn Corporation, a Virginia personal holding company, held significant shares in Alcoa, Inc. , following a merger with Reynolds Metal Co. The petitioner trusts, established by members of the Reynolds family, owned all of Davreyn's common and preferred stock. In February 2001, the trusts sold their Davreyn stock to Alrey Statutory Trust for $13,102,055. Prior to the sale, Davreyn transferred its Goldman Sachs fund shares to a newly formed LLC, Davreyn LLC, in which the trusts received membership interests. Post-sale, Alrey Trust liquidated Davreyn, sold the Alcoa stock, and engaged in a tax avoidance scheme involving the Son-of-BOSS transaction. The IRS subsequently issued notices of liability to the petitioner trusts, asserting transferee liability for Davreyn's unpaid federal income tax of $4,602,986, plus penalties and interest, totaling $10,753,478.

Procedural History

The IRS issued notices of deficiency to Davreyn Corporation, which were not contested, leading to assessments totaling $10,753,478. Subsequently, the IRS issued notices of liability to the petitioner trusts under IRC Section 6901, asserting their liability as transferees for Davreyn's unpaid tax. The petitioner trusts filed petitions with the U. S. Tax Court challenging these notices. The court heard the case and issued its opinion, holding that the petitioner trusts were not liable as transferees under Section 6901.

Issue(s)

Whether the petitioner trusts are liable as transferees under IRC Section 6901 for

© 2025 SCOTUSreports.com. All rights reserved.

Davreyn Corporation’s unpaid federal income tax liability for the taxable year ended February 15, 2001, based on the sale of their Davreyn stock to Alrey Statutory Trust?

Rule(s) of Law

IRC Section 6901(a) allows the IRS to collect a transferor’s unpaid federal income tax from a transferee if three conditions are met: (1) the transferor must be liable for the unpaid tax, (2) the other person must be a “transferee” within the meaning of Section 6901, and (3) an independent basis must exist under applicable state law or state equity principles for holding the other person liable for the transferor’s unpaid tax. The applicable state law is that of the state where the transfer occurred. In this case, Virginia law governs the determination of transferee liability.

Holding

The U. S. Tax Court held that the petitioner trusts are not liable as transferees under IRC Section 6901 for Davreyn Corporation’s unpaid federal income tax liability. The court determined that the IRS failed to establish an independent basis under Virginia law for holding the trusts liable as transferees, as the trusts did not engage in any fraudulent transfer and lacked knowledge of the subsequent tax avoidance scheme.

Reasoning

The court rejected the IRS’s proposed two-step analysis, which would have applied federal substance-over-form doctrines to recast the transactions before applying state law. Instead, the court adhered to the principle established in Commissioner v. Stern, 357 U. S. 39 (1958), that state law determines the elements of transferee liability, and Section 6901 merely provides the procedure for collection. The court found no evidence that Virginia law would allow the transactions to be recast under a substance-over-form doctrine. Furthermore, the court concluded that the petitioner trusts did not have actual or constructive knowledge of Alrey Trust’s tax avoidance scheme. The trusts believed they were engaging in a legitimate stock sale and relied on their advisers’ recommendations. The court also found that Davreyn was solvent at the time of the stock sale and that the sale did not render it insolvent, thus precluding liability under Virginia’s fraudulent conveyance statutes or trust fund doctrine. The court’s decision was influenced by prior cases where similar arguments by the IRS were rejected, emphasizing the need for clear evidence of fraudulent intent and knowledge on the part of the transferee.

Disposition

The U. S. Tax Court entered decisions in favor of the petitioner trusts, holding that they are not liable as transferees under IRC Section 6901 for Davreyn Corporation’s unpaid federal income tax liability.

© 2025 SCOTUSreports.com. All rights reserved.

Significance/Impact

This case reinforces the principle that transferee liability under IRC Section 6901 requires an independent basis under state law, which cannot be established solely through federal substance-over-form doctrines. The decision highlights the importance of the transferee's knowledge and intent in determining liability and underscores the court's reluctance to collapse or recast transactions without clear state law authority. The ruling has implications for future cases involving complex tax avoidance schemes and the application of transferee liability, emphasizing the need for the IRS to establish a clear basis under state law when pursuing such claims.

© 2025 SCOTUSreports.com. All rights reserved.