

Norfolk Southern Corp. v. Commissioner, 104 T. C. 417 (1995)

Depreciation deductions under safe harbor leases are only available for property that qualifies for investment tax credit.

Summary

In *Norfolk Southern Corp. v. Commissioner*, the U. S. Tax Court clarified the application of depreciation deductions under safe harbor leases. The case involved intermodal cargo containers leased under a safe harbor agreement. The court held that depreciation deductions under section 168(f)(2) could not be claimed for containers that did not qualify for investment tax credit (ITC) under section 38. The key issue was whether these containers met the requirement of being used in the transportation of property to and from the United States, which was necessary for them to qualify as “qualified leased property” under section 168(f)(8)(D). The court’s reasoning emphasized the statutory linkage between ITC eligibility and depreciation deductions, impacting how future cases involving safe harbor leases would be analyzed.

Facts

In 1981, Norfolk Southern Corporation entered into a safe harbor lease agreement with Flexi-Van Leasing, Inc. , for approximately 38,000 intermodal cargo containers. The agreement allowed Norfolk Southern to claim investment tax credits and accelerated depreciation deductions. The containers were leased to over 675 shipping companies worldwide. The IRS challenged the eligibility of these containers for ITC, asserting that they were not used predominantly in the transportation of property to and from the United States, as required by section 48(a)(2)(B)(v).

Procedural History

The IRS issued notices of deficiency for the tax years 1981 through 1985, disallowing the claimed ITC and depreciation deductions. Norfolk Southern contested these deficiencies in the U. S. Tax Court. Initially, the court found that the containers must be used at least once each year in U. S. transportation to qualify for ITC. Upon reconsideration, the court clarified that containers not meeting the ITC criteria could not benefit from depreciation deductions under section 168(f)(2).

Issue(s)

1. Whether containers that do not qualify for investment tax credit under section 38 can still be eligible for depreciation deductions under section 168(f)(2)?

Holding

1. No, because only property that qualifies for ITC can be considered “qualified leased property” under section 168(f)(8)(D), and thus eligible for depreciation

deductions under section 168(f)(2).

Court's Reasoning

The Tax Court's reasoning was grounded in the statutory framework of the Internal Revenue Code. The court emphasized that section 168(f)(8) requires property to be "qualified leased property" to benefit from safe harbor leasing provisions. Under section 168(f)(8)(D), such property must be new section 38 property, which in turn requires the property to be used in a qualifying manner under section 48(a)(2)(B)(v). The court rejected the argument that a stipulation between the parties could override this statutory requirement, stating that the stipulation did not concede that nonqualified containers could still benefit from depreciation deductions. The court also noted that the temporary regulations under section 168(f)(8) supported their interpretation that only section 38 property could be considered for safe harbor leasing benefits.

Practical Implications

This decision has significant implications for tax practitioners and businesses involved in safe harbor leasing arrangements. It clarifies that depreciation deductions under section 168(f)(2) are contingent upon the property's eligibility for ITC under section 38. Practitioners must ensure that leased property meets the statutory requirements for ITC to claim depreciation deductions. The ruling also underscores the importance of carefully reviewing the terms of any stipulation in tax disputes, as such agreements cannot expand statutory rights. Subsequent cases have applied this principle, emphasizing the need for strict compliance with the statutory criteria for both ITC and depreciation under safe harbor leases.