Estate of Annabel Dye Graves v. Commissioner of Internal Revenue, 92 T. C. 1294 (1989)

A pre-1931 trust transfer is not includable in the decedent's gross estate under section 2036(c) even if the decedent retained certain powers over the trust.

Summary

In Estate of Graves, the decedent created an irrevocable trust in 1927, retaining income rights and the power to designate beneficiaries, which she relinquished in 1945. The Tax Court ruled that the trust corpus was not includable in her gross estate under sections 2036 and 2038. The court determined that the 1927 transfer qualified for exclusion under section 2036(c) as it occurred before March 4, 1931, and post-1945, the decedent retained no power to alter, amend, or revoke the trust, thus not falling under section 2038. This case clarifies the application of these estate tax provisions to pre-1931 trusts and highlights the importance of the timing and nature of powers retained by the settlor.

Facts

Annabel Dye Graves established a trust in 1927 with a corpus of $100,000, retaining the right to trust income, the power to designate beneficiaries, and various rights over the trustee. She expressly relinquished the right to revoke the trust in favor of herself or her husband. In 1945, Graves released her power to designate beneficiaries. Upon her death in 1983, the IRS sought to include the trust corpus in her gross estate under sections 2036 and 2038 of the Internal Revenue Code.

Procedural History

The estate filed a motion for summary judgment in the United States Tax Court, contesting the IRS's inclusion of the trust in the gross estate. The IRS filed a cross-motion for summary judgment. The Tax Court granted the estate's motion, ruling that the trust corpus was not includable under sections 2036 and 2038.

Issue(s)

1. Whether the 1927 transfer to the trust qualifies for exclusion from the decedent's gross estate under section 2036(c).
2. Whether the trust corpus is includable in the decedent's gross estate under section 2038 due to the powers retained by the decedent at her death.

Holding

1. Yes, because the transfer occurred in 1927, prior to March 4, 1931, and thus qualifies for exclusion under section 2036(c).
2. No, because after 1945, the decedent retained no power to alter, amend, or revoke the trust, and thus the trust corpus is not includable under section 2038.

© 2025 SCOTUSreports.com. All rights reserved.

Court’s Reasoning

The court applied section 2036(c), which excludes pre-1931 trust transfers from the gross estate if the settlor retained income rights or the right to designate beneficiaries. The court held that the 1927 transfer was irrevocable and thus qualified for the exclusion. The court distinguished this case from Commissioner v. Estate of Talbott, emphasizing that Graves had no express power to revoke the trust in her favor. Regarding section 2038, the court analyzed each power retained by the decedent at her death, concluding none amounted to a power to alter, amend, or revoke the trust. The court cited Estate Tax Regulations and case law to support its conclusion that the powers were managerial and fiduciary in nature, not altering the beneficial interests in the trust.

Practical Implications

This decision clarifies that pre-1931 trusts, even with retained powers over income and beneficiary designation, can be excluded from the gross estate under section 2036(c). Practitioners should carefully review the timing and nature of powers retained in pre-1931 trusts to determine their tax implications. The case also underscores that post-1945, a settlor’s retained powers must amount to a true power to alter, amend, or revoke to trigger inclusion under section 2038. This ruling has been influential in subsequent cases involving similar trusts and continues to guide estate planning and tax litigation involving pre-1931 trusts.

© 2025 SCOTUSreports.com. All rights reserved.