Catalano v. Commissioner, 81 T. C. 8 (1983)

The IRS can use surveillance methods to reconstruct unreported income if the method is reasonable and results in a reliable estimate.

Summary

In Catalano v. Commissioner, the IRS used a surveillance project at Caesar's Palace to reconstruct unreported 'toke' income of casino dealers. The court upheld the IRS's method, finding it reasonable and conservative. The dealers, who did not maintain adequate records of their income, were held liable for the deficiencies and negligence penalties. The case highlights the IRS's latitude in reconstructing income and the taxpayers' responsibility to maintain accurate records.

Facts

John Catalano and other dealers at Caesar's Palace in Las Vegas participated in a toke pooling arrangement. The IRS conducted a surveillance project, observing toke exchanges at the casino's cashier cage over 48 days from February 1976 to January 1977. Using this data, the IRS determined an average hourly toke rate and reconstructed the dealers' income for tax years 1976-1979. The dealers did not keep records of their toke income and reported arbitrary amounts on their tax returns.

Procedural History

The IRS issued deficiency notices for unreported toke income and negligence penalties. The dealers petitioned the U. S. Tax Court, which consolidated 112 cases. The court upheld the IRS's reconstruction method and found the dealers liable for the deficiencies and penalties.

Issue(s)

1. Whether the IRS's method of reconstructing the dealers' toke income based on surveillance data was valid.
2. Whether the dealers were liable for negligence penalties for failing to maintain adequate records of their toke income.

Holding

1. Yes, because the IRS's surveillance method was reasonable and resulted in a reliable estimate of the dealers' toke income.
2. Yes, because the dealers unjustifiably failed to maintain adequate records of their toke income, resulting in negligence under section 6653(a).

Court's Reasoning

The court applied the rule that the IRS has wide latitude in reconstructing income

© 2025 SCOTUSreports.com. All rights reserved.

when taxpayers fail to keep adequate records. The surveillance method was deemed reasonable because it was conducted in a public area, used a stratified random sampling plan, and applied a 95% confidence level to ensure conservative estimates. The court rejected the dealers' arguments about the reliability of the surveillance data, noting that any errors likely resulted in undercounting rather than exaggeration. The court also upheld the negligence penalties, citing the dealers' failure to maintain records as required by section 6001.

Practical Implications

This decision reinforces the IRS's ability to use surveillance and statistical methods to reconstruct unreported income, particularly in industries like gaming where cash transactions are common. Taxpayers in similar situations should be aware that the burden of proof lies with them to show the IRS's reconstruction method is unreasonable. The case also serves as a reminder of the importance of maintaining accurate records of income, as failure to do so can result in negligence penalties. Later cases, such as Cracchiola v. Commissioner, have upheld the use of average tip figures without requiring a confidence level, further solidifying the principles established in Catalano.

© 2025 SCOTUSreports.com. All rights reserved.