Engle v. Commissioner, 76 T. C. 915 (1981)

Percentage depletion is not allowable for advance royalties on oil and gas leases unless there is actual production in the year the royalties are received.

Summary

In Engle v. Commissioner, the U. S. Tax Court ruled that percentage depletion deductions under section 613A(c) of the Internal Revenue Code were not permissible for advance royalties received in 1975, where no oil or gas was produced that year. Fred and Mary Engle assigned two oil and gas leases, receiving advance royalties but retaining overriding royalties. The court held that because there was no "average daily production" in 1975, the Engles could not claim percentage depletion on the advance royalties. This decision was based on the statutory language requiring actual production to claim such deductions, leading to a significant ruling on how advance payments are treated for tax purposes in the oil and gas industry.

Facts

Fred L. Engle obtained an oil and gas lease in Campbell County, Wyoming, on July 1, 1975, and assigned it to Getty Oil Co. on October 6, 1975, retaining a 5% overriding royalty and receiving an advance royalty of $6,000. He also secured a lease in Carbon County, Wyoming, on September 2, 1975, which he and Mary A. Engle assigned to Marshall & Winston, Inc. , on October 22, 1975, retaining a 4% overriding royalty and receiving $1,600 as an advance royalty. No oil or gas was produced from these leases in 1975, and the Engles claimed percentage depletion on the advance royalties received that year.

Procedural History

The Commissioner of Internal Revenue determined a deficiency in the Engles' 1975 federal income tax and disallowed their claimed percentage depletion on the advance royalties. The Engles petitioned the U. S. Tax Court to challenge this determination. The court, with Judge Featherston delivering the majority opinion, and Judges Goffe and Fay issuing concurring and dissenting opinions respectively, ultimately ruled in favor of the Commissioner.

Issue(s)

1. Whether percentage depletion under section 613A(c) is allowable with respect to advance royalties received in 1975 when no oil or gas was produced from the leased properties that year.

Holding

1. No, because the statute requires actual production in the taxable year to claim

© 2025 SCOTUSreports.com. All rights reserved.

percentage depletion, and the Engles had no “average daily production” in 1975.

Court’s Reasoning

The court’s decision hinged on the interpretation of “production” under section 613A(c), which limits percentage depletion to actual production during the taxable year. The court found that the term “production” meant extraction, and since there was no extraction in 1975, no percentage depletion could be claimed. The majority opinion rejected the Engles’ argument that “production” could include future or hypothetical production, emphasizing the clear statutory language requiring actual production. The court also noted that prior case law allowing percentage depletion on advance royalties was superseded by the 1975 amendments to the tax code. Judge Goffe’s concurrence supported the majority’s interpretation, while Judge Fay’s dissent argued that “production” should include future extraction attributable to the year income was received.

Practical Implications

This ruling clarified that percentage depletion under section 613A(c) requires actual production in the year the advance royalties are received. It impacts how oil and gas leaseholders can claim tax deductions, potentially affecting their financial planning and lease negotiations. The decision underscores the importance of understanding statutory changes and their impact on existing tax practices. Subsequent cases and regulations would need to align with this interpretation, possibly leading to adjustments in how advance royalties are treated in the industry. The ruling also highlighted the need for clear legislative guidance on tax treatments of mineral rights and royalties, influencing future legislative and regulatory efforts in this area.

© 2025 SCOTUSreports.com. All rights reserved.