Ernestine M. Carmichael Trust No. 21-35 v. Commissioner, 73 T. C. 118 (1979)

Gain from the disposition of installment obligations can qualify as "subsection (d) gain" if it arises from a pre-October 9, 1969, sale, even if reported under section 453(d).

Summary

In 1968, two trusts sold stock in exchange for convertible debentures, electing to report the resulting gains under the installment method. In 1972, they sold some of these debentures, reporting the gains under section 453(d). The issue before the U. S. Tax Court was whether these gains qualified as "subsection (d) gain" for the alternative tax computation. The court held that they did, reasoning that the gain from the debenture sales was considered to arise from the original stock sale, which occurred before the critical date of October 9, 1969. This decision impacts how gains from installment sales are treated for tax purposes and provides clarity on the application of transitional tax rules.

Facts

In July 1968, the Ernestine M. Carmichael Trust No. 21-35 and the Irrevocable Living Trust created by Ella L. Morris for Ernestine M. Carmichael No. 21-32 sold their shares of Associated Investment Co. common stock to Gulf & Western Industries, Inc. , receiving 5 1/2-percent convertible subordinate debentures in exchange. The trusts elected to report the long-term capital gains from these sales on the installment method under section 453(b). In 1972, the trusts sold some of these debentures on the open market, reporting the gains under section 453(d).

Procedural History

The IRS determined deficiencies in the trusts' federal income tax for 1972, asserting that the gains from the debenture sales did not qualify as "subsection (d) gain" under section 1201(d). The trusts petitioned the U. S. Tax Court for a redetermination of these deficiencies. The court held a trial on the stipulated facts and rendered its decision on October 18, 1979.

Issue(s)

1. Whether the long-term capital gain reported by the trusts in 1972 from the sale of Gulf & Western debentures qualifies as "subsection (d) gain" under section 1201(d)(1) for the purpose of computing the alternative tax under section 1201(b).

Holding

1. Yes, because the gain from the sale of the debentures was considered to arise from the pre-October 9, 1969, sale of stock, qualifying it as "subsection (d) gain"

© 2025 SCOTUSreports.com. All rights reserved.

under section 1201(d)(1).

Court’s Reasoning

The court analyzed the statutory language and legislative history of sections 1201(d) and 453(d). It determined that the phrase “pursuant to binding contracts” in section 1201(d)(1) modifies “sales or other dispositions,” not “amounts received,” allowing gains from pre-October 9, 1969, sales to qualify as “subsection (d) gain. ” The court also noted that section 453(d) treats the gain from the disposition of installment obligations as arising from the original sale of the property. This interpretation was supported by the legislative intent to provide transitional relief for pre-1969 transactions. The court rejected the IRS’s argument that gains must be reported under section 453(a)(1) to qualify, finding that the reference to section 453(a)(1) in section 1201(d) was illustrative, not exclusive.

Practical Implications

This decision clarifies that gains from the disposition of installment obligations can be treated as “subsection (d) gain” if they arise from sales completed before October 9, 1969, regardless of whether they are reported under section 453(d) or 453(a)(1). This ruling has significant implications for taxpayers with installment sales, allowing them to potentially benefit from the lower alternative tax rate for gains from pre-1969 transactions. It also affects how legal practitioners advise clients on tax planning strategies involving installment sales and the timing of asset dispositions. Subsequent cases, such as those involving the interpretation of transitional tax provisions, have cited this case for its analysis of the “subsection (d) gain” definition.

© 2025 SCOTUSreports.com. All rights reserved.