Harman v. Commissioner, 74 T. C. 402 (1980)

Initiation fees paid to the New York Stock Exchange for membership are considered capital expenditures and must be added to the cost basis of the membership, not deducted as ordinary business expenses.

Summary

In Harman v. Commissioner, Richard Harman sought to deduct a $7,500 initiation fee paid to the New York Stock Exchange (NYSE) as an ordinary business expense after acquiring beneficial ownership of a seat. The Tax Court ruled that this fee was a capital expenditure, necessary for acquiring the membership asset, and thus not immediately deductible. The court's rationale was based on the fee's connection to the acquisition of a long-term asset, consistent with established tax principles regarding capital versus ordinary expenditures.

Facts

Richard Harman joined Cohen, Simonson & Rea, Inc. in 1968, acquiring nominal ownership of a NYSE seat. In 1973, Harman decided to start his own business and paid Cohen $80,500, which included $7,500 for the NYSE initiation fee required to transfer the seat to another shareholder of Cohen. Harman sought to deduct this initiation fee as an ordinary business expense on his 1973 tax return, but the IRS disallowed the deduction, treating it as a capital expenditure.

Procedural History

The IRS determined a deficiency in Harman's 1973 federal income tax and disallowed the deduction of the initiation fee. Harman petitioned the U. S. Tax Court for a redetermination of the deficiency. The Tax Court, in a fully stipulated case, ruled in favor of the Commissioner, holding that the initiation fee was a non-deductible capital expenditure.

Issue(s)

1. Whether the $7,500 initiation fee paid to the New York Stock Exchange, which was required for Harman to retain his membership upon leaving Cohen, Simonson & Rea, Inc. , constitutes an ordinary and necessary business expense under section 162(a)(1) of the Internal Revenue Code, or a non-deductible capital expenditure under section 263.

Holding

1. No, because the initiation fee is part of the cost of acquiring the NYSE membership, a capital asset, and must be added to the cost basis of that asset rather than deducted as an ordinary expense.

© 2025 SCOTUSreports.com. All rights reserved.

Court’s Reasoning

The Tax Court’s decision was grounded in the principle that a capital expenditure is an amount expended for the acquisition of an asset with a useful life beyond the taxable year. The court found that the initiation fee was directly tied to the acquisition of the NYSE membership, which is a capital asset. The court distinguished this case from Lehman v. Commissioner, where the beneficial ownership of the seats remained unchanged. Here, Harman’s payment of the fee was part of his acquisition of beneficial ownership of the seat, thus making it a capital expenditure. The court also referenced other cases where initiation fees were treated as capital expenditures, reinforcing the decision. The court quoted, “A capital expenditure is an amount expended for the acquisition of an asset having a useful life beyond the taxable year,” citing United States v. Akin, to support its conclusion that the initiation fee should be treated as part of the seat’s cost basis.

Practical Implications

This decision establishes that initiation fees for memberships in organizations like the NYSE, where the membership constitutes a capital asset, are not deductible as ordinary business expenses. Taxpayers and their advisors must include such fees in the cost basis of the asset for purposes of depreciation or capital gains calculation upon disposition. This ruling impacts how similar fees in other professional or business organizations should be treated for tax purposes. It also affects how businesses structure transactions involving memberships, ensuring that the tax treatment aligns with the court’s view of what constitutes a capital expenditure. Subsequent cases and IRS rulings have followed this precedent, further solidifying the treatment of initiation fees as capital expenditures.

© 2025 SCOTUSreports.com. All rights reserved.