Watson v. Commissioner, 69 T. C. 544 (1978)

An irrevocable banker's letter of credit is equivalent to cash and constitutes taxable income in the year it is received.

Summary

In Watson v. Commissioner, the court ruled that an irrevocable banker's letter of credit received by the taxpayer in 1973 for the sale of cotton constituted taxable income in that year. The taxpayer, a farmer, sold cotton and received a letter of credit from a bank, payable in January 1974. The court held that the letter of credit, which was assignable and readily convertible to cash, was equivalent to receiving cash in 1973. This decision impacts how similar financial instruments are treated for tax purposes, emphasizing the importance of the assignability and cash equivalency of such instruments.

Facts

H. N. Watson, Jr. , a farmer, sold 147 bales of cotton to Cone Gin, Inc. on November 29, 1973. As part of a deferred payment agreement, Cone Gin issued a Deferred Payment Authorization to Security State Bank & Trust Co. , which then provided Watson with an irrevocable banker's letter of credit for \$42,146. 51. The letter of credit was to be honored on January 10, 1974. Watson reported this income on his 1974 tax return, but the Commissioner of Internal Revenue determined it should be taxed in 1973.

Procedural History

Watson filed a petition with the United States Tax Court challenging the Commissioner's determination of a deficiency in his 1973 federal income tax. The Tax Court upheld the Commissioner's position, ruling that the income was taxable in 1973.

Issue(s)

1. Whether the receipt of an irrevocable banker's letter of credit in 1973 constituted taxable income for that year.

Holding

1. Yes, because the irrevocable banker's letter of credit was equivalent to cash and thus taxable income in the year it was received.

Court's Reasoning

The court applied Internal Revenue Code sections 1001 and 451, which define the realization and recognition of income for cash basis taxpayers. The court determined

that the letter of credit was "property" with "fair market value" under section 1001(b), akin to cash. It highlighted the letter's assignability and convertibility to cash, referencing Texas law which allows the beneficiary to assign the right to proceeds. The court cited cases such as Griffiths v. Commissioner and Williams v. United States to support its conclusion that the letter of credit was equivalent to cash. The court rejected Watson's argument about the bank's solvency, noting that the funds were irrevocably set aside for Watson and that the bank was solvent. The short delay until payment did not affect the letter's cash equivalency.

Practical Implications

This decision clarifies that an irrevocable banker's letter of credit, if assignable and readily convertible to cash, must be treated as taxable income in the year it is received, not when it is paid out. Legal practitioners must advise clients on the tax implications of such financial instruments, particularly in deferred payment arrangements. Businesses using similar deferred payment mechanisms need to understand that the IRS may treat these instruments as income in the year of receipt. Subsequent cases like Schniers v. Commissioner have considered this ruling in similar contexts. This case has influenced how deferred payment agreements are structured to avoid immediate tax liabilities.