Taylor v. Commissioner, 55 T. C. 1134 (1971)

Voluntary support payments made prior to a formal decree are not taxable as alimony unless made under a currently enforceable judicial order.

Summary

In Taylor v. Commissioner, the court addressed whether voluntary support payments made by a husband to his wife before a formal separation decree were taxable as alimony. Sylvia Taylor sought temporary alimony in her separation action, but the New York Supreme Court denied her request, conditioning the denial on her husband's continued voluntary payments. The Tax Court held that these payments were not taxable under section 71(a)(3) of the Internal Revenue Code because they were not made under a decree requiring such payments. The decision hinged on the absence of a currently enforceable judicial order, emphasizing that only payments mandated by such an order would be considered taxable alimony.

Facts

Sylvia Taylor filed for separation from Adam D. Taylor in the New York Supreme Court and sought temporary alimony. Adam had been making voluntary payments to Sylvia, including $60 weekly and covering household expenses. The court denied Sylvia's motion for temporary alimony on the condition that Adam continue these voluntary payments. Later, during the trial, the court orally increased the weekly payment to $100, but this was not formalized in a written order. The final separation decree was issued on September 3, 1964, and payments made after this date were reported as taxable alimony by Sylvia.

Procedural History

Sylvia Taylor filed a petition with the U. S. Tax Court challenging the IRS's determination that the payments made by Adam before the final separation decree were taxable. The IRS argued that the court's conditional denial of temporary alimony constituted a decree requiring payments under section 71(a)(3). The Tax Court ruled in favor of Sylvia, holding that the payments were not taxable because they were not made under a currently enforceable judicial order.

Issue(s)

1. Whether voluntary support payments made by a husband to his wife before a formal separation decree are taxable as alimony under section 71(a)(3) of the Internal Revenue Code?

Holding

1. No, because the payments were not made under a currently enforceable judicial order or decree as required by section 71(a)(3).

© 2025 SCOTUSreports.com. All rights reserved.

Court’s Reasoning

The court reasoned that for payments to be taxable under section 71(a)(3), they must be made under a decree that requires the husband to make payments for the wife’s support or maintenance. The court emphasized that the New York Supreme Court’s conditional denial of temporary alimony did not constitute such a decree because it had no immediate enforceable effect. The court distinguished between a warning and an enforceable order, noting that the conditional denial was merely a rationale for the court’s action and did not impose an immediate obligation on Adam. The court also noted that the trial court’s oral increase in payments did not satisfy New York law requirements for a decree. The decision was supported by the legislative intent to only tax payments made under formal judicial orders or written agreements, as reflected in the language and history of section 71.

Practical Implications

This decision clarifies that voluntary support payments made before a formal judicial order are not taxable as alimony. Practitioners should advise clients that only payments made under a currently enforceable decree or a written separation agreement are subject to taxation. This ruling may encourage parties to continue voluntary support arrangements during separation proceedings without immediate tax consequences. It also underscores the importance of formalizing court orders to ensure clarity on tax obligations. Subsequent cases may reference Taylor v. Commissioner when addressing the taxability of pre-decree support payments.

© 2025 SCOTUSreports.com. All rights reserved.