Andrew v. Commissioner, 54 T. C. 239 (1970)

Advances can be deductible as worthless debts if they create a bona fide debtor-creditor relationship and become worthless within the tax year.

Summary

In Andrew v. Commissioner, the Tax Court allowed deductions for advances made by the Andrews to their son-in-law's failing livestock auction business. The first $8,500 was deemed a nonbusiness debt under IRC section 166(d) because it created a genuine debt that became worthless in 1965. The subsequent $10,000, used to settle claims against the business, was deductible as a business debt under IRC section 166(f) since it discharged the Andrews' obligation as indemnitors. The court emphasized the need for a bona fide debtor-creditor relationship and the worthlessness of the debts at the time of payment.

Facts

William G. Boyd, the Andrews' son-in-law, operated a livestock auction barn in Missouri, requiring a bond to ensure payment to livestock owners. The Andrews agreed to indemnify the surety for any losses under the bond. They advanced Boyd $8,500 to help run the business, which soon failed. To avoid further losses, the Andrews paid $10,000 directly to the auction barn's creditors to settle claims, bypassing the surety.

Procedural History

The Andrews filed for deductions on their 1965 and 1966 tax returns. The Commissioner disallowed the deductions, leading to a deficiency notice. The Andrews petitioned the Tax Court, which ruled in their favor, allowing the deductions under IRC sections 166(d) and 166(f).

Issue(s)

1. Whether the $8,500 advanced to Boyd was deductible as a loss from a worthless nonbusiness debt under IRC section 166(d).
2. Whether the $10,000 advanced to liquidate claims against the auction barn was deductible as a worthless business debt under IRC section 166(f) or, alternatively, as a nonbusiness debt under IRC section 166(d).

Holding

1. Yes, because the advances created a bona fide debt that became worthless in 1965.
2. Yes, because the payment discharged the Andrews' liability under the indemnity agreement, and the underlying debts were worthless at the time of payment.

© 2025 SCOTUSreports.com. All rights reserved.

Court’s Reasoning

The court found that the $8,500 advanced to Boyd created a genuine debt, evidenced by checks marked as loans and the expectation of repayment within 90 days. The debt became worthless in 1965 due to Boyd’s insolvency. For the $10,000 payment, the court applied IRC section 166(f), treating the Andrews as the real guarantors despite the surety’s role. The court noted that the auction barn’s debts to customers were worthless at the time of payment, satisfying the section’s requirements. The court emphasized that a taxpayer need not wait for formal legal action to prove worthlessness, as long as the debt is objectively worthless.

Practical Implications

This case clarifies that advances can be deductible as worthless debts if they create a genuine debtor-creditor relationship and become worthless within the tax year. It also expands the scope of IRC section 166(f) to cover direct payments by indemnitors, even if made before the surety is called upon. Practitioners should advise clients to document advances as loans and assess the debtor’s financial condition to establish worthlessness. This ruling may encourage taxpayers to act swiftly in settling claims to minimize losses, rather than waiting for formal legal action. Subsequent cases have cited Andrew v. Commissioner in determining the deductibility of advances as worthless debts.

© 2025 SCOTUSreports.com. All rights reserved.