Estate of Tony Cordeiro, Deceased, Mary Cordeiro, Executrix, Petitioner v. Commissioner of Internal Revenue, Respondent; Estate of Tony Cordeiro, Deceased, Mary Cordeiro, Executrix, and Mary Cordeiro, Petitioners v. Commissioner of Internal Revenue, Respondent, 51 T. C. 195 (1968)

The fair market value of a dairy herd for tax purposes must be determined exclusive of the value of intangible marketing rights, such as membership in a cooperative and the associated 'base' allocation.

Summary

In Estate of Cordeiro v. Commissioner, the Tax Court determined the value of a dairy herd for tax purposes, excluding the value of intangible marketing rights. Tony Cordeiro's estate and widow, Mary, argued that the herd's value should include the marketing rights through the Protected Milk Producers Association (Protected). The court, however, ruled that these rights were separate from the herd's value. The herd was valued at $325 per cow, rejecting the petitioners' claim of $700 per cow that included the value of the marketing rights. The decision emphasized that marketing rights, while valuable, are not part of the tangible asset's basis for depreciation or loss calculation.

Facts

Tony and Mary Cordeiro operated a dairy farm in California, with 306 Holstein cows as community property. Tony was a member of Protected Milk Producers Association, which allocated him 406 pounds of 'base'—a measure of his share in the association's milk sales. Upon Tony's death, his estate and Mary continued to market milk through Protected. The estate tax return valued the herd at $700 per cow, including the marketing rights, but the Commissioner contested this, valuing the herd at $325 per cow, excluding those rights.

Procedural History

The Commissioner determined tax deficiencies based on a herd valuation of $325 per cow and later increased the deficiencies with an amended valuation of $260 per cow. The case was consolidated for trial with other similar cases and proceeded to the U. S. Tax Court, where the petitioners argued for a higher valuation that included the value of the marketing rights.

Issue(s)

1. Whether the fair market value of the Cordeiro dairy herd should include the value of the marketing rights associated with the Protected Milk Producers Association?

Holding

1. No, because the court determined that the marketing rights were separate and

© 2025 SCOTUSreports.com. All rights reserved.

distinct from the herd's value, and thus should not be included in the herd's valuation for tax purposes.

Court's Reasoning

The court reasoned that the marketing rights, including membership in Protected and the allocated 'base', were intangible and separate from the herd itself. The court cited its concurrent decision in Ralph Vander Hoek, emphasizing that these rights were not depreciable and should not be included in the herd's basis for tax purposes. The court considered several factors in valuing the herd: the age and quality of the cows, the availability of a market for the milk without the seller's base, and the value of the herd as an operating unit. The court found that the petitioners' expert testimony, which valued the herd at $750 per cow, improperly included the value of the marketing rights. The court concluded that the fair market value of the herd was $325 per cow, rejecting both the petitioners' higher valuation and the Commissioner's lower valuation of $260 per cow.

Practical Implications

This decision clarifies that for tax purposes, the valuation of tangible assets like dairy herds must exclude the value of associated intangible rights. Legal practitioners should ensure that clients distinguish between tangible and intangible assets when calculating basis for depreciation or loss. For dairy farmers and similar businesses, this ruling may affect how they structure sales and acquisitions of herds, as the value of marketing rights must be negotiated separately. Subsequent cases have followed this principle, reinforcing the separation of tangible and intangible asset valuation in tax assessments.

© 2025 SCOTUSreports.com. All rights reserved.