33 T.C. 753 (1960)

To qualify for income averaging under Section 107 of the 1939 Internal Revenue Code, compensation must be for personal services rendered over a period of at least 36 months, with at least 80% of the total compensation received in one taxable year, and the period of service begins when services are actually rendered to a specific party.

Summary

The case involves Charles O. Finley and Calvin L. Smith, partners in an insurance brokerage firm, who sought to allocate commissions received in 1952 from Continental Casualty Company over several years under Section 107 of the 1939 Internal Revenue Code, which allows income averaging for compensation from personal services rendered over 36 months. The court addressed whether the services began in 1946, when Finley conceived the idea for the insurance plan, or later, when the partnership contracted with Continental. The court found the service period began in 1951 when a definite service relationship with Continental began. Because they did not receive 80% of total compensation in a single tax year and because the period of service did not span 36 months the court disallowed the allocation.

Facts

Charles O. Finley and Calvin L. Smith formed a partnership, Charles O. Finley and Company, in 1949. Finley, due to a health issue, conceived the idea of providing a group insurance plan for the medical profession. In 1951, Finley and his partner contacted Continental Casualty Company, resulting in a contract for group insurance for the American College of Surgeons. The partnership received substantial commissions in 1952. Finley and Smith claimed these commissions should be allocated over several years under Section 107, alleging services began in 1946 when Finley began conceiving of the insurance plan. The IRS denied this allocation, asserting that the services began in 1951 and were not rendered for a sufficient duration to meet the section’s requirements. The partnership’s expenses for printing brochures and a penalty for failing to file an estimated tax declaration by Smith were also at issue.

Procedural History

The IRS determined deficiencies in income tax and additions to tax for 1952 against Finley and Smith. The taxpayers challenged the IRS’s decision in the United States Tax Court. The Tax Court reviewed the IRS determination of the tax liability under Section 107 and the additions to tax under Section 294(d)(1)(A) and (d)(2).

Issue(s)

1. Whether the petitioners were entitled to allocate the commission income received

© 2025 SCOTUSreports.com. All rights reserved.

in 1952 over multiple years under Section 107(a) of the 1939 Internal Revenue Code.

2. Whether the partnership expended, for printing, in 1952, an amount exceeding that claimed on the 1952 partnership return.

3. Whether petitioners Smith were liable for additions to tax under sections 294(d)(1)(A) and (d)(2) of the Internal Revenue Code.

Holding

1. No, because the compensation did not meet the 36-month requirement and the 80% requirement of Section 107.

2. No, because the evidence did not support printing expenses in excess of the amount claimed on the tax return.

3. Yes, petitioners Smith were liable for the addition to tax under section 294(d)(1)(A) and, per Commissioner v. Acker, No.

Court's Reasoning

The court examined whether the commissions qualified for income averaging under Section 107 of the 1939 Code. The court stated that the personal services must cover a period of 36 months or more and that 80% of the total compensation for personal services must be received in one tax year. The court held that the services in question began in 1951 when the partnership contracted with Continental, not in 1946 when Finley conceived the idea for an insurance plan, as the court stated that for services to have begun the services must be rendered to someone. The court found that the commissions in 1952 did not represent at least 80% of the total compensation for the service period, thus failing to meet requirements for income averaging. The court also noted that even if the services ended earlier than it did, the 36-month test still was not met. Finally, the court held the Smiths liable for the penalties, other than for substantial underestimation of tax.

Practical Implications

This case emphasizes that the beginning date for qualifying personal services under Section 107 requires a direct connection between the service provider and the recipient. It underscores that preliminary activities without an agreement or relationship do not count. Furthermore, the case's focus on how to determine the period of service clarifies that the duration should be assessed based on the actual performance of the services, which in this case, started when the insurance contract went into effect. This case highlights how the 36-month and 80% requirements must be applied. This can have significant implications in many contexts, not just insurance, but also sales, consulting, and other fields where compensation is earned over time or in installments. Subsequent cases referencing this ruling can

© 2025 SCOTUSreports.com. All rights reserved.

demonstrate its importance in tax law regarding income averaging. This principle remains relevant for interpreting similar provisions today. Businesses and individuals should carefully document the commencement and completion of their service relationships.

© 2025 SCOTUSreports.com. All rights reserved.