NBC Stores, Inc. v. Commissioner, 17 T.C. 136 (1951)

A net operating loss sustained by a subsidiary during a consolidated return period cannot be carried over and used to offset the subsidiary's income in a subsequent separate return year; furthermore, carrying forward losses already deducted in a consolidated return constitutes an impermissible double deduction.

Summary

NBC Stores, Inc. sought to carry forward net operating losses from 1940 and 1941 to offset its 1942 and 1943 income. In 1941, NBC Stores was part of an affiliated group that filed a consolidated excess profits tax return, where its 1941 loss was deducted. The Tax Court held that the losses could not be carried forward. It reasoned that Treasury Regulations prevent using losses from consolidated return periods in subsequent separate return years, and that allowing the carryover of the 1941 loss would result in an impermissible double deduction because it was already used in the consolidated return.

Facts

NBC Stores, Inc. sustained net operating losses in 1940 and 1941.
Since December 17, 1940, NBC Stores was a wholly-owned subsidiary of Universal Match Corporation.
For 1941 only, a consolidated excess profits tax return was filed by Universal Match Corporation and its subsidiaries, including NBC Stores.
NBC Stores' 1941 net operating loss was deducted in the consolidated return, reducing the consolidated excess profits net income.

Procedural History

NBC Stores filed separate excess profits tax returns for 1942 and 1943, not deducting the net operating loss carryovers from 1940 and 1941.
NBC Stores then filed claims for refund, seeking to deduct these carryovers.
The Commissioner denied these claims.

Issue(s)

1. Whether NBC Stores' corporation surtax net income for 1942 and 1943 should be computed by including deductions for net operating loss carryovers from 1940 and 1941, despite the 1941 loss being deducted in a consolidated return.

Holding

1. No, because Treasury Regulations prevent using net operating losses sustained during a consolidated return period to compute net income for a subsidiary in any taxable year after the last consolidated return period; furthermore, carrying forward the 1941 loss would result in an impermissible double

© 2025 SCOTUSreports.com. All rights reserved.

deduction.

Court’s Reasoning

The court relied on Treasury Regulations 110, section 33.31(d), which were promulgated under Section 730 of the Internal Revenue Code, giving the Commissioner authority to prescribe regulations for consolidated returns to reflect tax liability and prevent avoidance. These regulations state that “no net operating loss sustained during a consolidated return period of an affiliated group shall be used in computing the net income of a subsidiary…for any taxable year subsequent to the last consolidated return period of the group.” NBC Stores, by participating in the consolidated return for 1941, consented to these regulations.

The court found that the regulations applied to the computation of “Corporation surtax net income,” as this calculation involves net income. The court deemed it immaterial that the Commissioner did not disallow the net operating losses for 1940 and 1941 in the deficiency related to taxes under Chapter 1 of the Code, as those years involved separate returns.

Further, regarding the 1941 loss, the court reasoned that allowing a carry-forward would result in a duplication of deductions, as the loss was already deducted in the 1941 consolidated excess profits tax return, which is a result not intended by the statute.

Practical Implications

This case reinforces the principle that net operating losses generated within a consolidated group have limitations on their use in subsequent separate return years. Attorneys must carefully analyze whether a company participated in a consolidated return and whether the losses it is attempting to carry forward have already been utilized in a consolidated return. It highlights the importance of understanding and applying Treasury Regulations related to consolidated returns. It prevents taxpayers from obtaining a double tax benefit by deducting the same loss in both a consolidated return and a subsequent separate return. This case informs how similar cases should be analyzed, especially when dealing with corporations that have shifted between consolidated and separate filing statuses.

© 2025 SCOTUSreports.com. All rights reserved.