17 T.C. 166 (1951)

When an individual inherits property through intestate succession, a subsequent renunciation of that property constitutes a taxable gift to the individual who ultimately receives the property.

Summary

Ianthe and Gabrielle Hardenbergh, mother and daughter, were heirs to the estate of George S. Hardenbergh, who died intestate. Wishing to fulfill George's prior intent to leave the bulk of his estate to his son from a previous marriage, Ianthe and Gabrielle filed a "renunciation" of their interests in the estate. The Tax Court held that this renunciation constituted a taxable gift because, under Minnesota law, title to the property vested in them immediately upon George's death. Their subsequent action was therefore a transfer of property they already owned.

Facts

George S. Hardenbergh died intestate in Minnesota, leaving his wife Ianthe, his daughter Gabrielle, and his son George Adams Hardenbergh as his sole heirs.
Prior to his death, George S. Hardenbergh had expressed his intention to leave most of his estate to his son, George Adams Hardenbergh. He was unable to execute his will before his death.
Ianthe and Gabrielle, aware of George S.'s wishes and being independently wealthy, filed a "renunciation" of their interests in the estate with the probate court so that George Adams Hardenbergh would inherit the majority of the estate.

Procedural History

The Commissioner of Internal Revenue determined deficiencies in Ianthe and Gabrielle's gift tax for the year 1944, arguing that their renunciation constituted a taxable gift.
Ianthe and Gabrielle petitioned the Tax Court for a redetermination of the deficiencies.
The Tax Court consolidated the proceedings.

Issue(s)

Whether the petitioners made a taxable gift within the meaning of the gift tax provisions of the Internal Revenue Code by renouncing their respective interests in the estate of George S. Hardenbergh, deceased, thereby allowing the property to pass to George Adams Hardenbergh.

Holding

Yes, because under Minnesota law, title to the property vested in Ianthe and Gabrielle immediately upon George S. Hardenbergh's death, and their subsequent

© 2025 SCOTUSreports.com. All rights reserved.

renunciation constituted a transfer of property they already owned.

Court’s Reasoning

The court distinguished this case from cases involving the renunciation of bequests under a will, where the beneficiary has the right to accept or reject the bequest.
The court relied on Minnesota law, which states that title to real and personal property of an intestate descends to the heirs immediately upon death, subject only to the administrator’s right of possession for administration purposes.
Because title vested in Ianthe and Gabrielle immediately upon George S. Hardenbergh’s death, their “renunciation” was in effect a transfer of property they already owned. The court quoted Barnes v. Verry, 174 Minn. 173, 218 N.W. 551, stating that releases between coheirs of their rights in property are valid. Therefore, this transfer was subject to gift tax under section 1000 of the Internal Revenue Code.
The court also noted that donative intent was shown both by testimony and the recitals in the instrument of renunciation.

Practical Implications

This case establishes that the legal effect of a renunciation depends heavily on state law governing intestate succession.
Attorneys must carefully examine state law to determine when title vests in heirs. If title vests immediately, a subsequent renunciation will likely be treated as a taxable gift.
This decision highlights the importance of proper estate planning. Had George S. Hardenbergh executed his will, the outcome might have been different, as the beneficiaries could have disclaimed the bequest without gift tax consequences.
This case informs how to analyze similar cases: determine if title vests immediately, and if so, the attempted renunciation is a transfer. Later cases would cite this to distinguish between testamentary gifts and intestate succession when determining tax implications of renunciation.

© 2025 SCOTUSreports.com. All rights reserved.