Aprill v. Commissioner, 13 T.C. 707 (1949)

Payments made by a corporation to the widow of a deceased employee, absent any obligation or services rendered by the widow, are considered a gift or gratuity and are not subject to federal income tax.

Summary

The Tax Court addressed whether payments made by a corporation to the petitioner, the widow of a deceased employee, were taxable income or a gift. The corporation's resolution referred to the payments as in recognition of the deceased's services, and the corporation deducted the payments as salary expense. The court found that the payments were gratuitous because the petitioner performed no services for the corporation, and there was no obligation to compensate her for her husband's past services. Furthermore, the payments were not disguised dividends because bonuses paid to another stockholder were compensation for services rendered.

Facts

Anthony Aprill, the petitioner's husband, had directed a corporation (Frerichs) before his death. The corporation's board of directors resolved to pay the petitioner a certain sum of money. The resolution referred to the payments as "in recognition of his [Anthony Aprill's] services." The corporation deducted the payments as salary expense on its books and in its returns. The petitioner herself began employment with the company only after the payments in question had been made. Another stockholder, Boh, received bonuses, but these were deemed compensation for services rendered. The Commissioner argued that these payments were either compensation for services or a distribution of profits.

Procedural History

The Commissioner determined a deficiency in the petitioner's income tax, arguing that the payments received from the corporation were taxable income. The petitioner appealed to the Tax Court, arguing that the payments were a gift and thus not taxable.

Issue(s)

Whether payments made by a corporation to the widow of a deceased employee constitute taxable income or a tax-free gift, when the widow performed no services for the corporation and there was no legal obligation to make such payments.

Holding

No, because the payments were gratuitous and not intended as compensation for services rendered by the widow or a distribution of profits. The payments were deemed a gift and not subject to federal income tax.

© 2025 SCOTUSreports.com. All rights reserved.

Court’s Reasoning

The court focused on the intent behind the payments. Citing *Bogardus v. Commissioner*, 302 U.S. 34, the court stated that the inquiry must be directed to the purpose which motivated the corporation in making the payments. The court found no connection between the payments and any services rendered by the petitioner. The court reasoned that because the petitioner rendered no service and the corporation had no obligation to compensate her for her husband’s services, the payments were a gift. The fact that the corporation referred to the payments as “in recognition of his [Anthony Aprill’s] services” and deducted them as salary expenses was explained by the desire to comply with I.T. 3329, which authorized such treatment. The court also rejected the argument that the payments were a distribution of profits, noting that bonuses paid to another stockholder were actual earned compensation.

Practical Implications

This case clarifies the circumstances under which payments to a deceased employee’s family can be considered tax-free gifts. It emphasizes the importance of examining the intent behind the payments and whether the recipient provided any services in return. Subsequent cases will likely turn on factual distinctions regarding the existence of a legal obligation, the performance of services by the recipient, or evidence of a disguised dividend. This case provides guidance for businesses considering making payments to the families of deceased employees and for tax practitioners advising them. The case underscores the principle that the absence of any service rendered by the recipient strongly suggests that the payment is a gift.

© 2025 SCOTUSreports.com. All rights reserved.