McCartney v. Commissioner, 12 T.C. 320 (1949)

Payments received as a substitute for profits that would have been taxed as ordinary income are also considered ordinary income, not capital gains, even if those payments are received in a lump sum to extinguish future obligations.

Summary

Charles McCartney, a shareholder in Petrolane, had a contract entitling him to a portion of Petrolane's profits. When Petrolane modified a key gas purchase agreement, McCartney agreed, but only if he received substitute payments to offset his potential loss of profits. Years later, he received a lump-sum payment to extinguish this right to future payments. The Tax Court held that this lump-sum payment was taxable as ordinary income, not capital gains, because it represented a substitute for lost profits.

Facts

McCartney owned 30% of Petrolane stock and previously had a contract with Lomita Gas Company that was transferred to Petrolane. This contract influenced Petrolane's profits. In 1935, McCartney agreed to modify the gas purchase agreement between Petrolane and Lomita, which would increase Lomita's revenue but reduce Petrolane's profits. In exchange, McCartney secured a contract guaranteeing him payments to offset the reduced profits. In 1944, McCartney received $69,300 from Lomita to release them from the 1935 contract.

Procedural History

The Commissioner of Internal Revenue determined that the $69,300 received by McCartney was ordinary income. McCartney petitioned the Tax Court, arguing that the payment was a sale of a capital asset. The Tax Court ruled in favor of the Commissioner, upholding the determination that the payment constituted ordinary income.

Issue(s)

Whether a lump-sum payment received in exchange for releasing a contract right to future payments, which were designed to substitute for lost profits, constitutes ordinary income or capital gains for tax purposes.

Holding

No, because the payment was a substitute for profits, which are considered ordinary income, and the extinguishment of the contract was not a "sale or exchange" of a capital asset.

Court's Reasoning

© 2025 SCOTUSreports.com. All rights reserved.

The Tax Court reasoned that McCartney's 1935 contract did not sell or transfer a property interest. Instead, it provided a substitute for lost profits resulting from the modified gas purchase agreement. Since the payments were designed to replace profits, which are taxed as ordinary income, the lump-sum payment received to extinguish the right to those future payments was also ordinary income. The court cited *Hort v. Commissioner, 313 U.S. 28*, to support the principle that payments substituting for income are taxed as ordinary income. Even if the contract was considered a capital asset, its extinguishment did not constitute a "sale or exchange" as required for capital gains treatment. The court stated that "[t]he contract here was not sold, it was extinguished. Lomita acquired no exchangeable asset. The transaction, although in form a sale, was a release of the obligation." The court distinguished this situation from cases involving the disposition of a beneficial interest in a trust or the transfer of a right.

Practical Implications

This case reinforces the principle that the character of income (ordinary vs. capital) is determined by what it represents. Payments received as a substitute for items that would be taxed as ordinary income (like lost profits or wages) are also taxed as ordinary income, regardless of how the payment is structured. This decision impacts how legal professionals advise clients on structuring settlements and contracts, particularly when payments are designed to compensate for lost income streams. It clarifies that the form of the transaction (e.g., a lump-sum payment) does not override the underlying substance of the payment as a substitute for ordinary income. Later cases have applied this principle in various contexts, emphasizing the importance of analyzing the nature of the right being extinguished or transferred to determine the proper tax treatment.

© 2025 SCOTUSreports.com. All rights reserved.