10 T.C. 37 (1948)

A settlor is taxable on trust income when they retain substantial control over the trust, including the power to direct distributions and amend the trust, even if they do not directly benefit from the income.

Summary

Ferdinand Bower created an irrevocable trust, naming his wife, brothers, and sisters as beneficiaries, with undistributed income added to the corpus. Although he didn't reserve administrative powers or the right to receive income or corpus, Bower retained the power to direct distributions. Subsequently, he amended the trust (without explicit authority) to include the issue of beneficiaries. The Tax Court held that Bower was taxable on the trust income under Section 22(a) of the Internal Revenue Code because of his retained control over distributions and the ultimate disposition of the trust assets.

Facts

Ferdinand Bower established an irrevocable trust (Trust No. 189) with the National Bank of Flint as trustee, transferring 2,000 shares of G.M. Shares, Inc. stock. The trust was for the benefit of his wife, brothers, and sisters. Bower retained the right to direct the trustee regarding distributions to these beneficiaries, with undistributed income being added to the trust corpus. Upon Bower's death, Trust No. 189 was to be administered with two other existing trusts (Trust Nos. 78 and 79), and trust assets were subject to Bower's debts and taxes.

Procedural History

The Commissioner of Internal Revenue determined a deficiency in Bower's income tax for 1941, asserting that the net income of Trust No. 189 was taxable to Bower. Bower petitioned the Tax Court for a redetermination of the deficiency.

Issue(s)

Whether the income of Trust No. 189 is taxable to the settlor, Ferdinand Bower, under the provisions of Section 22(a) of the Internal Revenue Code.

Holding

Yes, because Bower retained substantial control over the trust income through his power to direct distributions, amend the trust (de facto), and because the trust assets could be used to pay his debts and taxes upon his death.

Court's Reasoning

The court applied the principles established in *Helvering v. Clifford*, focusing on the

© 2025 SCOTUSreports.com. All rights reserved.

extent of control the settlor retained over the trust. The court distinguished *Hawkins v. Commissioner*, where the settlor had less control, and relied on *Commissioner v. Buck*, where the settlor's retained powers resulted in the trust income being taxed to him. Although Bower didn't have the power to directly receive income, his power to direct distributions and amend the trust (even without explicit authority in the original document) was deemed equivalent to ownership. The court noted that Bower's actions of amending the trust to include new beneficiaries and directing distributions to them demonstrated his de facto power. Moreover, the fact that the trust assets were available to pay Bower's debts and taxes further supported the conclusion that he retained significant control. The court quoted *Helvering v. Horst*, stating, "The power to dispose of income is the equivalent of ownership of it."

Practical Implications

Bower v. Commissioner underscores that even when a trust appears irrevocable and the settlor doesn't directly benefit, the settlor can still be taxed on the trust income if they retain significant control. This case informs the analysis of similar trust arrangements by emphasizing that the ability to direct distributions, amend the trust, and have trust assets available for debts/taxes are critical factors indicating control. It also warns against making changes to trust documents if such changes are not explicitly authorized by the original instrument, as such actions can be interpreted as evidence of control. Legal practitioners must carefully assess the settlor's retained powers to advise clients on the potential tax consequences of trust arrangements. Later cases have cited Bower as an example of a grantor being taxed on trust income due to retained control, even without direct economic benefit.

© 2025 SCOTUSreports.com. All rights reserved.