2 T.C. 516 (1943)

A solvent taxpayer realizes taxable income when it repurchases its debt at a discount and uses the debt's face value to satisfy the obligation.

Summary

Fifth Avenue-14th Street Corporation purchased its own mortgage certificates at a discount and used them at face value to reduce its mortgage debt. The Tax Court held that the corporation realized taxable income to the extent of the difference between the face value and the cost of the certificates. The court found that the corporation was solvent and that the transaction was not a mere purchase price adjustment. The court relied on *United States v. Kirby Lumber Co.*, holding that a gain in net assets through debt reduction results in taxable income.

Facts

The Fifth Avenue-14th Street Corporation owned and operated a building in New York City. In 1925, the corporation entered into an agreement with New York Trust Co. to consolidate its mortgage debt. The agreement allowed the Trust Co. to issue certificates representing pro rata shares of the mortgage. The agreement allowed the corporation to deliver certificates to the trust company which it would accept at face value in reduction of the principal indebtedness. During 1935, 1936 and 1937 the corporation purchased some of its own mortgage certificates at a discount and surrendered them to the trust company at face value to reduce its debt.

Procedural History

The Commissioner of Internal Revenue determined deficiencies in the corporation's income tax for 1935, 1936, and 1937. The corporation petitioned the Tax Court for a redetermination, arguing it did not realize income from the debt reduction. The Tax Court ruled in favor of the Commissioner.

Issue(s)

1. Whether a solvent taxpayer realizes taxable income when it purchases its own debt at a discount and uses the debt's face value to satisfy the obligation.

Holding

1. Yes, because the taxpayer's assets are freed from the liability, resulting in a realized gain.

Court's Reasoning

The court rejected the taxpayer's arguments that it was insolvent and that no gain was realized until final disposition of the property. The court found the taxpayer was

© 2025 SCOTUSreports.com. All rights reserved.

solvent based on its balance sheets and expert testimony regarding the property's fair market value. The court distinguished cases involving purchase price adjustments, noting that the taxpayer's property value exceeded the debt. The court found that the satisfaction of debt through the use of discounted certificates resulted in taxable income under the rule of *United States v. Kirby Lumber Co.*, 284 U.S. 1 (1931), which held that the "acquisition of petitioner's own bonds at a discount increased the assets of the taxpayer" and constituted income. The court also distinguished *Helvering v. American Dental Co.*, 318 U.S. 322 (1943), because this case did not involve a gratuitous release of debt by a creditor. The certificates were property dealt with on the market and no direct negotiation occurred between debtor and creditor, as the Trust Co. was the intermediary.

Practical Implications

This case reinforces the principle that a company generally realizes taxable income when it repurchases its debt at a discount, provided the company is solvent. This is because the reduction in debt increases the company's net worth. The ruling highlights that an "alternative method of payment" provision in the initial debt agreement does not automatically shield the debtor from recognizing income. The court emphasized that the key consideration is whether the debtor's assets are freed from a liability, resulting in a realized gain. Later cases have distinguished *Fifth Avenue-14th Street Corp.* based on specific facts, such as insolvency or the existence of a true purchase price adjustment, but the core principle remains a fundamental aspect of tax law.

© 2025 SCOTUSreports.com. All rights reserved.